

The Effect of Eclectic Method on Students' EFL Reading Achievement with Different Motivation Levels

Rukminingsih¹; Aang Fatihul Islam²; Mecca Puspitaningsari
PGRI Jombang University, Jombang, Indonesia

Abstract

The eclectic method used in this study combines many methods for learning, including brain-targeted teaching and KWL, to accommodate diverse student learning styles. To meet the requirements of the Higher Education Curriculum and the Independent Curriculum, which advocate learning through a variety of instructional styles. The aims of this research were (1) to assess the effectiveness of eclectic method as a teaching strategy and (2) to see if there is an interaction between eclectic method as a teaching strategy and students' reading interest level towards students' critical reading success. A factorial 2 x 2 quantitative research design was used, and the sample consisted of two classes of 40 students each, one experimental and one control, from a higher education setting in Indonesia. The instrument was a reading comprehension exam. Two-way ANOVA was used to evaluate the data. The findings revealed that (1) there was a significant difference between the experimental class taught using eclectic blended learning and the control class taught using conventional teaching methods, and (2) there was an interaction between the eclectic method as a teaching strategy and students' reading motivation level in terms of critical reading achievement. These findings can also motivate teachers to teach using the Eclectic technique to improve pupils' reading achievement. Further research on eclectic teaching strategies combined with technological instruction is recommended.

Keywords: Eclectic method; Students' motivation; EFL reading comprehension

Date of Submission: 08-09-2024

Date of Acceptance: 18-09-2024

I. Introduction

Teaching English as a foreign language (EFL) involves challenging teaching strategies, particularly in the reading classroom, which should focus on engaging students' motivation. Reading is crucial for academic success in the modern era. Poor reading skills can hinder students' enthusiasm to learn (Kweldju, 2015; & Larkin, 2017). In the Critical Reading class, lecturers must understand effective teaching strategies to boost student motivation, as reading is a crucial academic skill in the 21st century. However, many students lack motivation to study due to their reading skills being less than satisfactory. Many students have difficulty with this skill, so they need innovative learning methods such as the Eclectic blended learning method.

Some researchers have found that the EFL critical reading class students were uninterested, unmotivated, and low achievement (Kweldju, 2015; Larkin, 2017 & Rukminingsih et al., 2021). Students' academic achievement is also determined by their motivation to learn (Azar & Sahar, 2021). Foreign language teachers should be creative and imaginative to engage students and motivate them to learn the language (Pal et al., 2016). Amudson (2017) suggests that teacher-led activities might foster intrinsic drive to learn EFL reading by using methods and resources that interest them while also enjoying their surroundings and freedom of choice.

Effective teaching strategies influence student motivation. When students are dissatisfied with the teacher's method, their motivation will be low. Students who are not interested in the teaching technique are less motivated to study (Azar, (2021) and Admuson (2017). That is why the educator should find out the teaching method which can enhance students' motivation and students' achievement. Eclectic method is one of teaching methods which accommodate students' learning styles and students' needs. It also motivates students in learning EFL reading and it influences in the students' achievement in EFL reading course.

The eclectic method provides multiple viewpoints on objects by utilizing various methods. This strategy allows the lecturers to use several methods to explain the material to students. Eclecticism promotes dynamic learning and helps lecturers find common ground across diverse teaching approaches. Ali (2022), Alam & Sultana (2021) & Biggs (2020) state that to address all student needs and challenges, teachers must use many

methodologies. Teachers must be proficient in multiple techniques to effectively address the requirements of all students and improve regular education.

The Eclectic method for language teaching is understood as a combination of several learning models in one lesson. Eclectic is a learning model that addresses the limitations of using a single model, which is less effective in accommodating diverse learning styles within a single class. This is in line with research findings by Brett (2022); Soria & Prabhu(2023) &Summa (2021) which states that The eclectic approach is a language education method that integrates various methodologies to cater to the learning objectives, abilities, and styles of students.

According to Asif & Khan (2022). Biggs et al (2020) & Mwanza (2017). emphasizes the importance of an eclectic approach in learning and according to him the eclectic approach is pluralistic, consistent and involves diverse learning activities and is in accordance with variations in learning styles and students' needs which of course adapts the material.

Combining different teaching methods and ideas enables teachers to adjust lessons to their students' preferences. The eclectic teaching method is thought to be the most effective for instruction. According to Richards & Rodgers (2014), an eclectic approach enables instructors to choose the most effective resources for their classes based on the dynamic situation. Sooria & Prabu (2023) stated that the eclectic method is more effective in matching the needs and learning preferences of individual students. The eclectic method enables students to quickly assimilate and recall material by tailoring it to their particular learning needs and styles based on skill evaluations. The importance of eclectic teaching methods, especially in inclusive classrooms, cannot be underestimated. Based on this fact, the researchers conducted this study utilizing an eclectic method, combining multiple learning methods such as flipped classroom, brain-targeted teaching, and KWL, to accommodate heterogeneous student learning styles. To meet the needs of the Higher Education Curriculum and the Merdeka Curriculum, which advocate learning based on the diversity in students' learning styles in the classroom.

The eclectic method used in this study included three different methods. They were flipped classroom, brain-targeted instruction, and KWL. A flipped classroom is a mixed learning strategy that aims to increase student engagement and learning by requiring students to complete readings at home while focusing on interactive problem solving in class Bergmann & Sams (2014). Then combine with Hardiman's (2012) brain-targeted teaching technique, which has six target brains: (1) emotional climate, (2) physical environment, (3) learning design, (4) teaching for mastery, (5) knowledge application, and (6) evaluation using formative and summative assessments. The KWL approach is a teaching and learning strategy that aims to promote reading comprehension and engagement (Sholeh et al., 2020). It stands for the following:

- K (Know) refers to students' prior knowledge of the issue.
- W (Want to Know): What students want to know about the issue.
- L (Learned) refers to what students have learned following the lesson.

This strategy encourages students to use their prior knowledge, set learning objectives, and think about what they've learned. It works particularly well with expository reading materials such as textbooks and articles. Lecturers can use KWL charts to measure students' comprehension and discover knowledge gaps, adapting lessons to their needs. The researchers combined three kinds of these methods for one meeting and one topic.

Studies on eclectic method have been recently conducted by some scholars however, there have been few studies on higher education students and they use different combination of teaching methods in their eclectic method. In this research, the researchers use flipped classroom, brain-targeted teaching (BTT) and KWL. Most of the previous studies on eclectic method employ qualitative design and survey, however, in this research, the researchers employ experimental research by using motivation as a moderator variable to know whether there is an interaction among the implementation of eclectic method, students motivation and students' achievement in critical reading course. These findings concluded that combining several learning methods can accommodate the diversity of students' abilities. Thus, this research can answer various research gaps, including theoretical, empirical, methodological and setting gaps from previous studies by investigating eclectic method on students' EFL critical reading achievement with different motivation level. The research questions of the study are the following :

1. Is there any significant different between students taught by eclectic method and control class taught by flipped classroom,?

2. Is there an interaction among eclectic method as a teaching method and students' reading motivation level toward students' critical reading achievement?

II. METHODS

Research Design

The research design for this research was conducted in English Language Education Department at PGRI Jombang university by employing factorial design 2×2 to compare two teaching methods involving eclectic method for an experimental class and flipped classroom method for control class and two types of students' motivation (high and low). The factorial design 2×2 is used to measure 2 factors and 2 levels (Rukminingsih et al., 2020). There were three variables in this research, In this study, the independent variables are the eclectic method for the experimental class and the flipped classroom as a traditional teaching method for the control class, the dependent variable is students' reading achievement, and the moderator variable is students' reading motivation levels (high and low motivation levels).

Sample and Data Collect

This research was carried out in a higher education setting namely IAIN Ponorogo located in East Java Province, Indonesia. The randomly selected sample consisted of eighty students majoring in English Language Education. This study's sample consisted of students enrolled in the Critical Reading course. Class A was the experimental class, taught using the eclectic approach, and class B was the control class, taught using the flipped classroom. Each class had 40 pupils (20 high and 20 low motivation levels). The critical reading course was provided in the fifth semester. The research design was described on Table 1.

Table 1. 2×2 Factorial Design

Factor Teaching Strategy	Eclectic Method (A1)	Flipped Classroom (A2)
Level Motivation Level		
High Motivation Level (B1)	A1.B1	A2.B1
Low Motivation Level (B2)	A1.B2	A2.B2

This table 1 above depicted as the following:

A1B1: Students who have high motivation are taught by eclectic method

A2B1: Students who have high motivation are taught by flipped classroom as a conventional method

A1B2: Students who have low motivation are taught by eclectic method

A2B2 :Students who have low motivation are taught by flipped classroom as a conventional method

The data was gathered from students' reading motivation questionnaires and reading comprehension examinations. The questionnaire was used to assess students' reading motivation and classify them into two categories: high and low. The questionnaire employs a Likert scale and was designed with accompanying indicators of students' reading motivation. A reading comprehension test was utilized to assess students' progress in EFL reading comprehension.

Data Analysis

A reading comprehension test was utilized to assess pupils' EFL reading abilities. This study used a two-way ANOVA with a significance level of $\alpha = 0.05$. The two hypotheses were investigated using this way. The two-way ANOVA requires two assumptions: normality and homogeneity. The F and Barlet tests were used to determine homogeneity, while the Lilliefors test was used to assess normality.

III. Results

The results were presented in two sections to address two research questions. Table 2 provides a summary of data description, whereas table 3 summarizes the calculation results of two-way ANOVA.

Table 2. A summary of Data Description

Statistical Values	A1	A2	B1	B2	A1B1	A1B2	A2B1	A2B2
Number (N)	40	40	40	40	20	20	20	20
Highest score	36	33	93	70	38	28	34	31
Lowest score	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
Mean	29.06	27.02	82.36	62.77	32.55	25.11	27.09	25.24
Median	29.00	27.44	81.00	63.50	32.04	26.00	28.66	26.00
Mode	29.00	29.00	77.00	66.00	32.00	28.35	35.22	29.02
Standard deviances	4.55	4.12	5.52	4.38	2.83	3.11	4.88	3.23
Variances	20.24	17.22	34.02	18.89	7.98	12.14	10.11	7.92

The two-way ANOVA analysis included variance in mean score, between teaching methods, students' reading motivation toward students' reading achievement, interaction, error, and treatment approach. A summary is provided below. To better understand the analysis of variance, consider two-way ANOVA, as shown below.

Table 2. Summary on Calculation Result of Two Way ANOVA

Variance	DK (Df)	Sum of Squares	Mean Squares	F observed	Ft A(a)=0,05)
Teaching Methods	1	309	309	29.12	3.88
Students' Reading Motivation	1	79	79	8.88	3.88
Interaction	1	175	175	15.44	3.88
Error	70	813	12.74	-	-
Means of Treatment	1	56	-	-	-
Total	75	56	-	-	-

The two-way ANOVA results were used to validate and identify the study hypotheses. The table above summarized the results of the testing hypothesis. The data reported in the table supported the alternate hypothesis.

The observed F value revealed the value of F in three variances (teaching technique (29.12), students' reading desire (8.88), and interaction (15.44), whereas the table value of F was only 3.88 for three variances. It could be concluded that the two hypotheses were confirmed at alpha 0.05, as the first hypothesis was that the students' achievement in critical reading comprehension taught by using eclectic method was better than those taught by flipped classroom, and the second hypothesis was that there was an interaction between teaching techniques, students' achievement in critical reading course, and the level of students' motivation in EFL reading achievement was confirmed.

IV. Discussion

Based on the study's results, the eclectic method was effective in teaching a critical reading course to students with high and low motivation. Based on the findings, it described students' achievement in the critical reading course using an eclectic method. The intellectual knowledge of the eclectic technique has significantly increased. Eclecticism promotes dynamic learning and helps lecturers identify common ground between multiple methods of teaching. It is in line with Ali (2022), Alam & Sultana (2021), and Biggs (2020) that teachers must employ a variety of techniques to meet all of their students' needs and problems.

To effectively meet the needs of all students and improve regular education, teachers must be adept in a variety of ways. According to Asif and Khan (2022). Biggs et al. (2020); Mwanza (2017). highlights the need of

an eclectic approach to learning, which he defines as pluralistic, consistent, and involving varied learning activities, as well as being responsive to changes in learning styles and students' requirements, which, of course, adapts the content. It could be concluded that there is any significant different between experimental class taught by eclectic method learning and control class taught by conventional teaching method. so the alternative hypothesis has been confirmed. This result supports the previous studies.

The outcomes of two- way ANOVA study found a significant interaction between teaching methods and motivation. Effective teaching methods and motivation are critical for increasing learning outcomes. The interaction was examined to find out which group did better in reading comprehension. According to this study, pupils who were taught using an eclectic style were more driven than those who were not motivated. Students who were taught using the eclectic method with strong reading motivation performed better in reading comprehension than students who were taught in a flipped classroom. On the other hand, students with little motivation perform better in critical reading when taught using an eclectic method rather than a flipped classroom.

According to Amudson (2017), teacher-led activities may build intrinsic motivation to acquire EFL reading by allowing students to choose methods and resources that are interesting to them while also appreciating their surroundings and freedom of choice. Effective teaching tactics influence student motivation. When students are unsatisfied with the teacher's method, they will be less motivated. Students who are uninterested in the teaching method are less likely to study Azar (2021) and Admusion (2017). That is why the educator should discover a teaching strategy that will increase students' motivation and achievement. The eclectic technique is a teaching strategy that accommodates students' learning styles and demands. It also stimulates students to learn EFL reading and influences their performance in the EFL reading course. The results depicts that there is an interaction among eclectic method as a teaching strategy and students' reading motivation level toward students' critical reading achievement, so the alternative hypothesis has been confirmed. It also supports and modified the previous studies.

V. Conclusion

Based on the results and discussion, the eclectic method significantly impacted students' reading achievement and motivation. Based on the findings and discussions, the eclectic method used in the experimental class compares to the flipped classroom, a traditional method used in the control class. It revealed two conclusions. The eclectic method for teaching critical reading to students is effective. There is a statistically significant relationship between students' motivation and achievement in critical reading comprehension. Students' achievement in critical reading is influenced by their motivation level and the teaching method used.

The study proposes that instructors use an eclectic method when teaching English as a foreign language. This adaptable approach combines techniques from many methods, emphasizing context-sensitivity and learner-centeredness. Educators should prioritize students above methods, tailoring instruction to meet their needs. The study's drawbacks in using an eclectic method to teach critical reading include contextual constraints, recurrent dialogues, and a lack of systematic reviews. Despite this, the strategy remains adjustable and debatable, allowing instructors to choose techniques that are fit for their students' needs and situations while incorporating technology. Additional study is needed to address these limitations.

Acknowledgement

The study has been funded by Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education, Indonesia through passing the National Fundamental Grant of 2024.

References

- [1] Azar, A.S., & Sahar, S.A (2021). Factors Affecting Malaysian Undergraduate Students' Motivation In M Improving English Proficiency In Academic Environments In Higher Education Challenges In South-East Asia. Pp.35-73. Ig Global. <https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-7998-4489-1.Ch003>
- [2] Alam, M. M., & Sultana, T. . (2021). Challenges And Effectiveness Of Eclectic Method At Higher Secondary Level In Rural Bangladesh. *Iiuc Studies*, 17(1), 73–86. <https://doi.org/10.3329/iuc.v17i1.54986>
- [3] Al-Khasawneh, F. (2022). A Systematic Review Of The Eclectic Approach Application In Language Teaching. *Saudi Journal Of Language Studies*, 2(1), 17–27. <https://doi.org/10.1108/Sjls11-2021-0022>

- [4] Ali, H. F. M. (2022). An Eclectic Approach: Enhancing Adult Learners' Oral Fluency In English With Special Reference To Phonological Awareness. A Case Study. *Research In Language Teaching*, 20(20), 274-311. <https://doi.org/10.21608/Ssl.2022.144083.1144>
- [5] Asif, F., & Khan, I. A. (2022). The Eclectic Approach In Teaching English For Communication. In: Ali Raza, N., Coombe, C. (Eds) *English Language Teaching In Pakistan*. English Language Teaching: Theory, Research And Pedagogy. Springer, Singapore. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-7826-4_20
- [6] Amudson, L. *Increasing Intrinsic Motivation And Reading Comprehension (2017)*. (Research Report Maed Degree). The SaintChaterine University, Usa.
- [7] Biggs, A., Limtasiri, O., & Watchana, U. (2020). Principled Eclecticism: A Mix And Match Solution For Rural Thai Classrooms? *Asia-Pacific Social Science Review*, 20(4), 111-124.
- [8] Brett, T. (2020). Principled Eclecticism In The Classroom: Exploring The Use Of Alternative Methodologies In Elt. *Arab World English Journal(Awej)*. Proceedings Of 2nd Mec Tesolconference 2020. 212-228. Doi: <https://dx.doi.org/10.24093/Awej/Mec2.15>
- [9] Bergmann, J., & Sams, A. (2014). *Flip Your Classroom: Reach Every Student In Every Class Every Day*. International Society For Technology In Education, 2(8), 110-121.
- [10] Hardiman, M., Delgado, S., Grizzard, C. O., Novak, S., Stella, J., & Gentry, K. (2012). *The Braintargeted Teaching Model For 21st Century Schools: Reading Companion And Studyguide*. (89-90). Corwin Press.
- [11] Kweldju, S. (2015). English Department Students Interest And Strategies In Reading Their Content Area Textbooks. *Teflin Journal*, 8(1): 104-117
- [12] Larking, M. (2017). Critical Reading Strategies In The Advanced English Classroom. *Apu Journal Of Language Research*. 2(4), 50-68.
- [13] Mwanza, D. S. (2017). The Eclectic Approach To Language Teaching: Its Conceptualization And Misconceptions. *International Journal Of Humanities Social Sciences And Education*, 4(2), 53-67. <https://doi.org/10.20431/2349-0381.0402006>
- [14] Pal, N., Halder, S., & Guha, A. (2016). Study On Communication Barriers In The Classroom: A Teacher's Perspective. *Online Journal Of Communication And Media Technologies*, 6(1), 103-118. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.29333/Ojcm/2541>
- [15] Richards, J. C., & Rodgers, T. S. (2014). *Approaches And Methods In Language Teaching*. Cambridge University Press. Retrieved From <https://books.google.com.pk/books?id=Hrhkawaaqbaj>
- [16] Rukminingsih, Mujiyanto, J., Nurkamto, J., & Hartono, R. (2021). The Impact Of Online Instruction Integrated With Brain Based Teaching To Efl Students With Different Motivation Level. *Journal Of E -Learning And Knowledge Society*, 17(1), 66-73. <https://doi.org/10.20368/1971-8829/1135339>
- [17] Rukminingsih, A. G. & Latief, M.A. (2020). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan*. Erhaka Utama.
- [18] Sagar, N., & Afzal, T. (2019). English Language Teaching Through An Eclectic Approach For Engineering Students. *International Journal Of Recent Technology And Engineering Ijrte*, 7(5s4), 755-758.
- [19] Sarifa, N. (2020). Enhancing Efl Learners' English Proficiency And Intelligence By Implementing The Eclectic Method Of Language Teaching. *Arab World English Journal (Awej)*, 11. Doi: <https://dx.doi.org/10.24093/Awej/Vol11no1.9>
- [20] Sooria, M., & Prabu, S. (2023). Exploring The Significance Of Eclectic Approach: Perspectives, Difficulties And Development Of Effective Speaking Skills Among The Undergraduate Learners In Kerala. *Journal Of Survey In Fisheries Sciences*, 10(4s). 1975-1989. <https://doi.org/10.17762/Sfs.V10i4s.1423>
- [21] Summa, S. A. (2021). Application And Justification Of Eclectic Approach (An Innovative Teaching Style) For Elt Practitioners In Both Private And Public Universities In Bangladesh. *International Journal Of English Language Studies*, 3(1), 17-25. <https://doi.org/10.32996/Ijels.2021.3.1.3>
- [22] Sholeh, A., Rosalina, N. E., & Weganova, R. (2020). The Implementation Of Kwl (Know, Want To Know, And Learned) To Improve Students' Reading Comprehension. *Indonesian Journal Of English Education*, 7(1), 22-31.